

File No:
2024/01487/01

26 September 2024

Ref No:
22174526

Karen Ferguson
Planning Officer
Commission Assessment
Planning and Land Use Services
Department for Housing and Urban Development
Level 10, 83 Pirie Street
Adelaide SA 5000

karen.ferguson@sa.gov.au

For the attention of the State Commission Assessment Panel

212 Churchill Road Prospect

The following advice is in relation to the referral for application 24003161. In my capacity as a referral body for advice, I would like to offer the following comments for your consideration.

The proposal was not presented to the Design Review panel.

The proposal is for a five storey (approximately 17 metre tall) mixed use apartment building comprising 21 dwellings, ground floor commercial tenancy, undercroft car parking and roof terrace. The apartment mix comprises:

- 12 studio apartments
- six, one-bedroom apartments
- three, two-bedroom apartments.

I support the ambition for this proposal to provide medium density housing in this location with convenient access to public transport and inner suburban amenity. However, in my view, there are a number of interrelated design and technical issues that require further resolution to fulfill this ambition.

Site Context

The site is located toward the northern extent of Prospect, proximate Regency Road to the north and Devonport Terrace (and the Gawler rail corridor) to the west.

The site has an area of approximately 710 square metres, an approximately 15 metre frontage (east) and a depth of approximately 47 metres. An existing single storey detached dwelling and outbuildings operating as a commercial premise occupy the site (proposed to be demolished). An approximately five metre wide crossover is located at the southeast corner of the site fronting Churchill Road. A Significant Tree is located in the northeast corner of the site and proposed to be removed. An arborist's report provided as part of the planning application does not support removal of the tree however, also acknowledges that development could not proceed as proposed without the tree's removal.

The immediate context adjacent the site includes:

- north - single storey detached dwelling and outbuilding operating as a commercial premise (214 Churchill Road)
- east - Churchill Road
- south - four storey tall apartment building with undercroft car parking (210 Churchill Road)

Level 1
26-28 Leigh Street
Adelaide SA 5000

GPO Box 1533
Adelaide SA 5001

T- +61(0)8 7133 3235
E- odasa@sa.gov.au



File No:
2024/01487/01

- west - single storey (double height) commercial warehousing with walls on boundary (207 Devonport Terrace).

Ref No:
22174526

Existing built form in the locality comprises low to medium scale residential dwellings, apartment buildings and a variety of commercial development fronting Churchill Road. The site is within the Urban Corridor (Boulevard) Zone, where a maximum height of four storeys is envisaged. However, it is understood the scale of urban form along Churchill Road is increasing with examples proximate the site of between four and eight storeys tall.

Ground Plane and Access

All access is proposed from Churchill Road. Vehicle access is via a centrally located two way crossover and setback panel lift door into an undercroft car parking area. A total of 19 car parking spaces are provided, including one accessible space. Two car stackers are proposed to accommodate 10 vehicles. Six bicycle parking spaces are indicated on the ground floor plan within the undercroft area, noting the planning report describes the provision for eight bicycle spaces.

A commercial tenancy (envisaged as a laundrette) north of the vehicle entrance is set back behind a soft landscaped zone, fire hydrant booster and formalised concrete paving. A pedestrian entry is located south of the vehicle entry door and set back from the street by services infrastructure and formalised concrete paving. A fire isolated stair, lift, waste enclosure and bicycle parking are all located behind the pedestrian entry along the south boundary. A pad mounted transformer and traffic bollards are proposed at the street frontage, noting the transformer is located within the future road widening zone.

In principle, I support an active use fronting Churchill Road. However, I am concerned by several issues in relation to the ground plane, access strategy and residential amenity. To optimise the ground plane configuration and improve the public realm outcome, accessibility and amenity, I recommend consideration of the following aspects of the design:

- sense of arrival and address for apartment residents and visitors, in particular the pedestrian entry and lack of an entry lobby
- location of services (transformer and fire hydrant booster) including visual impact, compromised pedestrian access and potential conflict with future road widening (noting encroachments within the transformer easement zone)
- access to natural light and ventilation for the commercial tenancy given the location and extent of openings and approximately 10 metre deep floorplate
- potential impact of any additional infrastructure required on the street frontage (for example gas and water meters)
- confirmation of waste management strategy, including collection timing and vehicle maneuvering that may result in pedestrian/vehicle conflict
- confirmation provisions for escape are compliant, including the proposed external (articulated) stair arrangement to the rear of the building
- confirmation of proposed bicycle parking spaces
- support for removal of a Significant Tree and extent and viability of proposed soft landscaping at the street frontage.

Level 1
26-28 Leigh Street
Adelaide SA 5000

GPO Box 1533
Adelaide SA 5001

T- +61(0)8 7133 3235
E- odasa@sa.gov.au

Building Height and Built Form

The proposed overall building height is approximately 17 metres tall with no defined podium. Ground floor built form is typically built to the boundary except at the Churchill Road frontage (east) where setbacks are as follows:

- commercial tenancy (three metres)
- vehicle and pedestrian secure line (approximately nine metres)
- communications room (approximately four metres).



File No:
2024/01487/01

Ref No:
22174526

First floor setbacks are as follows:

- east (street frontage) - balcony set back approximately 1.5 metres and external walls set back approximately four metres from the Churchill Road boundary
- north – balcony extends along the boundary for approximately 12 metres from the front elevation then built form set back two metres
- east - balcony and core extends along the boundary for approximately 15 metres from the front elevation then built form set back two metres
- west – built form set back three metres from the boundary, noting an external egress stair is located within the three metre setback.

Built form setbacks for the upper levels replicate the first floor configuration, with the exception of the north and south portions of the Churchill Road apartment balconies.

In principle, I support a building of this scale in this location. However, I am concerned by the potential amenity impacts to the neighbouring apartment building at 210 Churchill Road (south) given the proposed height, limited built form separation of zero to four metres and apartment living areas (210 Churchill Road) typically single aspect, north facing. I also note the proposed location of the lift core that will result in a sheer precast concrete wall adjoining the neighbouring level one apartment balcony.

I acknowledge the proposed built form setbacks seek to align with planning policy. However, I recommend consideration of the impact on amenity, particularly access to sunlight for the neighbouring residents (south). I also recommend consideration of the proposed location of the building core with the view to providing separation from the neighbouring balcony.

Architectural Expression and Materiality

The overall architectural expression can be characterised as a series of deep horizontal elements with prefinished fibre cement sheet cladding in light and dark greys above a precast concrete base in a natural finish.

The precast concrete base element at the Churchill Road frontage partially wraps around the north and south boundaries extending to a height of approximately 5.4 metres. Illuminated (white acrylic) signage is proposed above the entrance to the commercial tenancy. Precast concrete is proposed for the building core and a four metre high, 16 metre long section of wall adjacent the car stackers (north).

The upper built form to the Churchill Road frontage comprises balconies framed by expressed, rectilinear elements in dark grey fibre cement sheet cladding with vertically oriented aluminium screening centrally between apartments. Upper level external walls are light grey fibre cement sheet 'Cemintel Barestone'. Framed glass balustrades are proposed for all balconies and the rooftop communal area. I support the use of a simple material palette comprising prefinished materials that require minimal maintenance. However, I recommend further refinement of the composition of the street frontage, particularly the ground floor with the view to:

- clearly define the base element with consideration of the fine grain materiality and residential character of the surrounding context
- increase visual permeability and activation of the street frontage to provide a positive contribution to the public realm and welcoming arrival experience for residents and visitors.

Fixed (opaque) glazed openings are proposed along the south elevation to manage overlooking into the neighbouring site. Balustrades for north and west oriented balconies are proposed at a height of approximately 1.5 metres however it is unclear if these are intended to be transparent or opaque.

Level 1
26-28 Leigh Street
Adelaide SA 5000

GPO Box 1533
Adelaide SA 5001

T- +61(0)8 7133 3235
E- odasa@sa.gov.au



File No:
2024/01487/01

Ref No:
22174526

I recommend demonstration of interface conditions from balconies, windows and the rooftop communal space, including any strategies to mitigate overlooking into adjacent sites. I also recommend consideration of potential future development to the north on the proposal.

Apartment Amenity

I acknowledge the apartment and private open space areas typically meet the minimums envisaged under planning policy. However, I have several concerns in relation to occupant amenity and recommend confirmation/consideration of the following aspects of the design:

- provision of any affordable apartments
- provision of any accessible apartments or incorporation of Livable Housing Design standards
- opportunities for cross ventilation in apartments and extent of operable portions of windows
- direct connections between wet areas and living areas
- approximately 2.5 metre wide bedroom for the typical one bedroom apartment
- apartments fronting Churchill Road:
 - o proposed strategies to mitigate noise impacts
 - o lack of a bedroom window for the second and third floor one bedroom apartments
 - o small (snorkel) window arrangement for the first floor one bedroom apartment
 - o access to the bathroom via a bedroom in the one bedroom apartment
 - o rationale for the proposed smaller (2.1 metre tall) three panel sliding door for the first floor one bedroom apartment
 - o efficiency of circulation space in the one and two bedroom apartments.

There are also several drawing inconsistencies that require clarification:

- locations of window shade hoods (legibility between plans and elevations)
- accuracy of the useable areas on balconies, particularly on the third floor fronting Churchill Road (annotated areas appear to incorporate extent beyond the balustrade)
- location of fridge (conflicting with sink) and hot water service in the bedroom of the typical end studio apartment
- access into bathroom for the typical one bedroom apartment.

Communal Amenity

An approximately nine metre wide by 21 metre long communal space is proposed on the rooftop, set back three metres from the north, east and south boundaries. A stair extends the full height of the building enabling access to the rooftop communal space however, the lift terminates at the floor below (third floor). I support the ambition for a communal area to serve the apartment residents. However, I strongly recommend the provision of equitable access to all parts of the proposal.

I acknowledge the landscape concept proposes a selection of drought tolerant species in planter boxes to the communal space. However, I note approximately two thirds of the communal space is covered, resulting in soft landscaping in shade for extended periods. I recommend engagement of a landscape consultant to ensure a successful landscaping strategy and an integrated architecture and landscape outcome.

I support the provision of natural light to the communal corridors and recommend the inclusion of natural ventilation noting the proposed fixed glazing.

Level 1
26-28 Leigh Street
Adelaide SA 5000

GPO Box 1533
Adelaide SA 5001

T- +61(0)8 7133 3235
E- odasa@sa.gov.au



File No:
2024/01487/01

Ref No:
22174526

Environmentally Sustainable Design (ESD)

I support the inclusion of solar panels and external shading to windows. I note the north facing windows for the two bedroom apartments do not appear to incorporate external shade hoods. I recommend consistency of the external shading strategy to all relevant openings. An ESD report is not available at the time of writing this referral. I recommend early engagement of a sustainability consultant to establish and integrate ESD initiatives within the project including confirmation of any targets for thermal performance (NatHERS).

Summary

The key issues relating to the proposal are summarised below. In my view, there would be value in further resolution of these matters prior to consideration by the State Commission Assessment Panel in order to achieve an optimal outcome for the development and site:

- location of services (transformer and fire hydrant booster) with consideration to visual impact, pedestrian access and potential future road widening in coordination with the City of Prospect
- sense of arrival and address for apartment residents and visitors, particularly the pedestrian entry and lack of an entry lobby
- demonstration the provisions for escape are compliant
- interface conditions between the proposal and adjacent sites including impacts to neighbouring amenity and confirmation of strategies to mitigate overlooking from balconies, windows and the rooftop communal space
- confirmation of any proposed Environmentally Sustainable Design initiatives and integration with the proposal.

I trust the above comments assist with making your assessment.

Yours sincerely



Kirsteen Mackay
Government Architect

cc Damien Heffernan ODASA damien.heffernan2@sa.gov.au

Level 1
26-28 Leigh Street
Adelaide SA 5000

GPO Box 1533
Adelaide SA 5001

T- +61(0)8 7133 3235
E- odasa@sa.gov.au



From: Heffernan, Damien (DHUD)
Sent: Monday, 24 February 2025 5:13 PM
To: Hastie, Callum (DHUD)
Subject: 212 Churchill Road Prospect Referral_Updated Comments
Attachments: [DOCS_AND_FILES-#22174526-v1-ODASA_DR_240926_Referral_Referral_Letter_212_Churchill_Road_Prospect.pdf](#)

OFFICIAL: Sensitive

Dear Callum,

Thank you for the response and updated drawings provided by 3D Design & Drafting in relation to the Government Architect's referral advice for application (24003161), and for the opportunity to provide updated comments.

Ground Plane and Access

- We acknowledge the following in relation to the ground plane and access:
 - Improved sense of arrival and address with the addition of a lobby and relocation of the transformer away from the apartment entry
 - Improved natural light and ventilation to the commercial tenancy
 - Consideration of additional ground mounted infrastructure (gas and water meters)
 - Additional input on waste management strategy, including collection timing and confirmation of safe vehicle access. Recommend consideration of any hard and e-waste requirements for the development
 - Confirmation of proposed quantity of bicycle parking spaces.
- We continue to recommend consideration of the following aspects of the ground plane and access:
 - Consideration of strategies to mitigate visual impact (for example screening) and improve the development's streetscape presentation
 - Confirmation with the relevant authority in relation to any potential conflict with the transformer location and future road widening
 - Confirmation provisions for escape are compliant, including the proposed external (articulated) stair arrangement to the rear of the building
 - Support for removal of a Significant Tree.

Building Height and Built Form

- Noting minimal changes since the original referral, the Government Architect's comments and recommendations related to building height and built form remain as per the original referral letter issued 26 September 2024.

Architectural Expression and Materiality

- We acknowledge an improvement to the visual permeability and arrival experience for residents and visitors and recommend confirmation of the amended material treatment for the vehicle entry door. Other comments and recommendations related to architectural expression and materiality remain as per the original referral letter issued 26 September 2024.

Apartment Amenity

- We acknowledge the provision of an acoustic assessment subsequent to the planning application with proposed strategies to mitigate noise impacts for the development. We note that in section 5.1 of the acoustic assessment the composition of walls and roof are assumed to be masonry. We understand the primary wall composition for the apartments is to be lightweight framing clad with 9mm fibre cement sheet (Cemintel Barestone) cladding and the roof is a combination of metal deck and paved surface (rooftop terrace). We recommend amending the acoustic assessment to reflect the materials specified in the architectural documentation.
- We acknowledge the following amendments to apartments with the intent to improve amenity:
 - bedroom windows included to the second ([L2-9](#)) and third floor ([L3-16](#)) one bedroom apartments
 - access to bathrooms (noting potential clashes in the studio apartments between entry doors and bathroom doors)
 - consistency in the size of openings
 - resolution of internal conflicts in relation to fridges and hot water service locations
- We recommend consideration of the value of the newly introduced openings from apartments into communal corridors in relation to amenity and potential privacy issues
- Other comments and recommendations related to apartment amenity remain as per the original referral letter issued 26 September 2024.

Communal Amenity

- We do not support the removal of natural light from communal corridors which we previously supported
- We support the amendment to the lift (previously terminating at the third floor) that now allows equitable access to the rooftop terrace
- We support the reorganisation of the rooftop terrace that considers soft landscaping access to sunlight
- Other comments and recommendations related to communal amenity remain as per the original referral letter issued 26 September 2024.

Environmentally Sustainable Design (ESD)

- We support the consideration of a consistent shading strategy, particularly the 2 bedroom north facing apartments which now appear to incorporate shade hoods
- We continue to recommend engagement of a sustainability consultant to establish and integrate ESD initiatives within the project.

We attach a copy of the original referral letter to be read in conjunction with the above comments.

I trust the above comments assist with your assessment.

Warm regards,

Damien Heffernan

Senior Design Advisor
Office for Design and Architecture SA
Department for Housing and Urban Development

T 08 7133 2964

W odasa.sa.gov.au

91 Halifax Street, Kaurana/Adelaide SA 5000

**OFFICE FOR
DESIGN+
ARCHITECTURE SA**



We have moved
91 Halifax Street
Adelaide SA 5000

The Department for Housing and Urban Development acknowledges First Nations people as the Traditional Custodians of South Australian land and waters and we extend our respect to Elders past, present and emerging. We value and recognise the ongoing cultural heritage, beliefs and relationship First Nations peoples have with these lands and waters and the continuing importance of this today.

DISCLAIMER: The information in this e-mail may be confidential and/or legally privileged. It is intended solely for the addressee. Access to this e-mail by anyone else is unauthorised. If you are not the intended recipient, any disclosure, copying, distribution or any action taken or omitted to be taken in reliance on it, is prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this email in error, please delete it from your system and notify the sender immediately.